MINUTES
October 20, 2005
City Services Committee
City of Batavia

Chairman Volk called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call

Members present: Aldermen Volk, Vance, Wollnik, Barnard, Liva, and Frydendall (7:40 p.m./Item 4)
Members absent: Alderman Dietz
Also present: Aldermen Sparks and Wolff; Mayor Schielke (7:55 p.m./Item 4); Bill McGrath, City Administrator; Bill Darin, Fire Chief; Tom Springer, Fire Prevention Officer; Kathy Montanari, Recording Secretary

2. Approval of Minutes

None.

3. Items Added/Removed/Changed

None.

4. Fire Stations Update

McGrath reviewed his October 19, 2005 memo.

Project history:

Chris Hansen, project architect with Kluber, Skahan and Associates, Inc., provided a brief history of the project. In 1999, the firm investigated water infiltration issues at the east side fire station. The cost for masonry restoration was approximately ($200,000). The firm then was asked to review long-range plans for that station so funds were not spent needlessly on a building that could require a major renovation in the near term. At the City's request, a program booklet was prepared in 2000-01 and it was determined that additional square footage was needed. The City also requested an evaluation of the west side fire station due to a shortage of bunk space there. A quick study was done to show a bunk space addition, but that was viewed as a temporary solution. The firm also prepared program booklets for the west side fire station in 2002. During a review of those booklets, staff made suggestions to pare the project back and the project was placed on hold. A year later, the project was reactivated and the firm was asked to prepare concept plans, based on the pared-back program booklet.

Original Concept – East Side Fire Station:

The original concept for the east station called for a two-story addition, new basement, and renovation of the existing apparatus bay. Those plans included a training facility in the basement, along with support spaces and an outside access. The concept of sharing the training room space with ESDA for an Emergency Operations Center (EOC) had not been yet been discussed. The first-floor addition/renovation included a day

room, dining room, kitchen, large and small conference rooms, and an office. The second floor consisted of administration offices, bunk rooms (non-private), and locker room space. During the nearly three years the projects were on hold, many advances were made in fire station design, especially with respect to living quarters and increased security issues.

Original Concept – West Side Fire Station:

A plan was produced in 2003 for the west side fire station, and ESDA was incorporated into that scheme. ESDA would be losing its downtown space and it was thought that it could be more economical to provide space them in connection with the fire station projects. An addition to the west station to house ESDA apparatus was proposed, along with a second-floor mezzanine for their storage needs. The addition included staff work rooms, second-floor living quarters, an expanded day room and dining room, and the addition of an EOC to the basement to be shared with ESDA. This plan did not move forward due to financial constraints.

Project costs were adjusted for inflation when new program booklets were produced in 2003. The existing stations are approximately 7,500 square feet and original concepts proposed to add about 8,500 square feet to each station. Current concepts call for 16,000- to 17,000-square-foot additions at each facility.

Current Concept – East Side Fire Station:

The current concepts for both stations have added aesthetics to the projects, in an effort to create gateways on both sides of the community. The character of the buildings is in keeping with Batavia's standards and also utilizes a residential scale.

The east station concept continues to have a basement and a two-story addition. An expanded apparatus bay/support area has been added to the plan. The façade would be renovated with maintenance-free materials. Additional space on the east side of the building would consist of administration and living quarters, as well as an EOC/training facility in the basement. A connection in the original plans of the parking lot to Cottonwood Circle was removed due to neighborhood concerns. The parking lots will be enlarged from 24 to 46 spaces, which is slightly under the City's requirements. The square footage by floor is 5,308 square feet (new basement), 15,000 square feet (1st floor), and 8,800 square feet (2nd floor) for a total building size of 29,000 square feet. All spaces outlined in the program booklets were included in the concept.

Wolff asked if existing walls would be retained within the building. Hansen explained that firefighters would be occupying the station during construction, so the addition was designed to fit around the existing structure with some modifications. The construction manager will be asked to review floor heights within the existing structure, as they are currently less than desired. A linear scheme for interior circulation was used for maximum space efficiency.

Hansen said the new front public lobby would have controlled access to the remainder of the building. Administrative offices, conference rooms, and work rooms are located

on the first floor. A radio room and gear storage rooms are located adjacent to the apparatus bays. The addition is positioned so it does not undermine existing footings. An apparatus bay was added to accommodate a proposed, new ladder truck that would be longer than the current truck. In conjunction with the new bay, a vehicle maintenance room was added to remove that equipment from the apparatus floor. A gear laundry room was also put into the space behind the bay, and noisy compressors would be relocated to the west end of the structure.

Hansen then reviewed second floor space at the east station. Outside windows would be provided for the private bunk rooms, which is in keeping with the current trend for sleeping quarters. Also included are the day room (with outdoor deck), dining room, kitchen, and locker space. A new design concept was used for the locker room. Two separate locker room facilities would share a private shower/changing room space, which is a more cost-effective use of space. Many of the existing window openings were used for the new door locations to save money. The conditioning room was relocated to the far west end of the building to allow for quicker access to the apparatus floor from the bunk rooms.

The basement will house the training/EOC room, so the number of windows will be very limited. There are also training support and storage spaces. A skylight system is used over the basement corridor.

Vance asked if the basement storage space would be adequate for future needs. Hansen responded that janitor's closets were added to every level, along with a file storage room. There is also storage within the individual spaces, and Hansen said it should be sufficient to accommodate the needs of the department.

Current Concept – West Side Fire Station:

The current concept remains essentially the same as the original, except that the existing one-story structure will be removed. The narrow width of the site could not contain all the necessary elements, so more creativity was needed. Parking will be increased from the existing 13 spaces to 23 spaces. Siding will be removed from the existing building where the apparatus is housed, and it will be replaced with a masonry façade. The existing roof structure will be reviewed with the construction manager and specifics have not yet been determined. Access to the proposed new water tower is through the staff parking lot. Storm water detention is provided at the natural low part of the property just east of the water tower location.

The first floor contains a public lobby with controlled access, a combined staff workroom/radio room, day room, dining room, and kitchen with a covered outdoor patio area. An outdoor stairwell will provide direct access to the basement. Support rooms are located adjacent to the apparatus bays. An ESDA apparatus bay was added on the western portion of the building, along with two ESDA offices.

The second floor has ten bunk rooms with outside windows, a quiet sitting space off the circulation area, conditioning room, locker room (same as east side), and storage room. A second floor mezzanine ESDA storage area is located over the new apparatus bay.

The basement concept is similar to the east station. The outdoor exterior stairwell allows for security-controlled direct access. ESDA had originally requested an EOC/training room at this location, but the decision was made to invest in technology for a flexible-use space at the east station. The basement has a smaller, multi-use training room that can be used by either the City or ESDA. Kitchen and storage space is also provided in the basement.

Exteriors will be very similar for both stations. In the current scheme for the west station, the roof would be removed, leaving the skeleton. Towers will house vertical circulation (stairwells and elevators). Split-faced stone will be used to give a rough-textured, Batavia limestone look to the base of the building. Above that will be dark-colored brick masonry, with colored concrete tiles just under the roof line or masonry of a contrasting color. The plan does not include a third-story level in the tower, but it may be possible to extend stairs to it. An eyebrow window provides light into the lobby space. Residential-type windows with wood interiors and metal-clad exteriors would be used. Suggested front overhead doors are largely glass to provide natural light to the space; back overhead doors can be discussed with the construction manager. Roof lines, roof materials, and window positions are still being developed. Hansen indicated that he would be attempting to minimize flat roof sections.

Barnard asked if the flared-out roof design was necessary, and Hansen said it added to the character of the structures. It may be discussed with respect to cost, but he preferred to keep it in the design.

Wollnik said in her review of meeting notes there was a discussion of drywall versus masonry construction. She noted that one of the west side bunk rooms is next to the elevator shaft, which may be too noisy. Also, four of the bunk rooms are across the hall from the conditioning room. Hansen responded that apparatus and apparatus support areas are of masonry construction at the west station. At the east station, some drywall may be used in the apparatus and support areas. Living quarters are surrounded mostly by drywall with insulation. Hansen then pointed out the types of materials to be used in various parts of the stations.

Wolff liked the placement of stairwells in outside corners and the linear layouts, as well as the extra space for future use. Hansen noted that although space was added to the plans, this was technically necessary in order to accommodate the required uses. The plans are a result of numerous meetings with staff and the subcommittee, and every space had been accounted for. Hansen indicated that he was keeping a list of possible items to discuss with the construction manager that may reduce costs. There may be other ways to lower costs, but those would result in a cut in the scope. Cost per square foot is within the mean for other recently built stations in the area.

Vance asked if both stations would have adequate space for future needs, since she preferred to address issue that now. Hansen said a great deal of research went into the population projections on which the space needs were based. Vance thanked Hansen and the staff subcommittee for their efforts with the plans.

Hansen explained that the project was still being refined and his next step would be to resolve roof lines and connectivity issues. Plans are nearly at the stage where a price estimate could be developed. The construction manager briefly reviewed budgets during negotiations and they seemed feasible.

Frydendall asked which part of the west station would be torn down, and Hansen said the one-story, east section would be removed. The apparatus floor structure and support utilities would remain. Frydendall asked if the apparatus structure was worth saving. Hansen said his structural engineer preliminarily reviewed that issue and felt it would be worthwhile to save it. Frydendall was concerned about the weight load on the structural system. Hansen said structural issues within the building had not been fully evaluated.

Wollnik asked if the project was at the stage where the construction manager could begin to offer suggestions, and Hansen said yes. McGrath added that he was in the process of finalizing a contract with the proposed construction manager.

Springer asked if the new rubber-membrane roof systems were more reliable. Hansen said yes, and warranties from 15-40 years were available.

McGrath asked whether it would simplify roof pitch issues if it is found that it would be less expensive to remove and re-erect steel. Hansen said it could be done either way and it may turn out to be more economical to remove the steel.

McGrath noted that the purpose of the meeting was to review how the project grew in size from the original concept. It may not have been apparent without a close review of the booklets that the total scope had increased. McGrath said he would ensure that all members of the City Council receive work group minutes. While it was a difficult decision to split the City Council into smaller groups, this was necessary to efficiently carry out the process. Changes in the scope were primarily the result of City Council suggestions after their visits to other fire stations, lobby issues, and ESDA issues.

Barnard commented that while it may be too soon to comment on colors or design, she wanted to ensure that the City Council had an opportunity to give input before the project was too far along to allow it.

McGrath asked if committee members felt that any of the spaces, with the exception of ESDA space that is not fully resolved, were extravagant or excessive.

Wolff said he felt it was important to provide sufficient apparatus space, so he was please to see an extra bay at the east station. Regarding ESDA space, the Fire Department should be able to use it if the organizational structure changes in the future. McGrath predicted that more space would be needed for medical issues in future years. Wolff also supported the idea of providing training space on both sides of the community.

Vance thought the presentation was helpful in bringing the committee up-to-date.

McGrath said firefighters had input into the practicalities since the inception of the project.

Wolff suggested that the conditioning room and storage room be swapped at the west station to keep the noise away from sleeping quarters.

McGrath asked committee members if they were satisfied with the design and space needs shown in the current plans. The committee expressed no concerns.

Frydendall said past experience had shown that HVAC systems were problematic in buildings with many small offices. Hansen said he planned to resolve this issue by using residential-type commercial furnaces throughout the buildings. Individual temperature controls would be seen as a luxury item and were not included.

Budget/Bonding:

Bond Amount	*Debt Service*	*% of Non-Home Rule Sales Tax ($1.95 million est. in 2007)*
$ 8 million	$598,000	30.0%
9 million	673,000	34.5%
10 million	748,000	38.3%

McGrath reminded committee members that the non-home rule sales tax proceeds would be used to fund street infrastructure projects, which will make those funds available for bond payments on the fire station projects.

Current Cost Estimates:

Construction (including 7.5% contingency, furniture/fixtures, and allowances)	$7,857,801
Construction manager and costs	1,000,000
A & E (including revised architectural fees, soil borings, surveys, and civil engineering)	604,221
TOTAL	$9,462,022

The estimates do not include unknown factors such as cost for natural gas during construction and asbestos removal. Hansen reported that the only asbestos issue relates to mastic on the floor tile, which should be relatively inexpensive to handle. It is hoped the project can be timed such that there will not be any exterior masonry work in the wintertime, which would require plastic walls. Natural gas costs are estimated to increase about 60% from last year, but utilities are a pass through anyway.

McGrath then addressed a previous question from Wollnik regarding architectural fees. He said it appeared that the projects could be built at a favorable cost per square foot. Kluber Skahan was hired because references indicated that their buildings could be built very close to their estimates, a very important consideration to the City. McGrath explained that the working group and staff needed direction as to whether or not they could proceed with these stations at their current size. Volk said the committee would meet on November 1 and one of the agenda items would be a discussion of the request for increased architectural fees. He hoped that a contract for the construction manager would also be available by that date.

Mayor Schielke pointed out that the east station was built 25 years ago, and the west station was built 20 years ago. Both were built as inexpensively as possible. It is hoped that these buildings will serve Batavia for 75+ years. He believed that the proposed designs were much more aesthetically pleasing and appropriate for the gateways to the community. Schielke felt this was a wise investment in Batavia's future.

Wolff also preferred to build the stations for long-term use. He then asked if there would be any changes in architectural fees if it is determined that more demolition is necessary. Hansen said demolition was figured into the revised fees. He pointed out that since those fees were originally calculated, the scope of the project had nearly doubled.

Hansen said the project was still on schedule to begin the bidding process in spring 2006. He felt it was crucial to make a decision on the construction manager by November 1. In the meantime, Hansen will continue to work on the look of the east station and develop a few other options for the west station, based on comments from this meeting. McGrath reported that soil borings would take place within the next week and he would advise residents of that activity. In addition, staff will hold a meeting for the neighborhood very soon. Hansen added that both stations must go through the Planned Development review, so engineering plans should be done in anticipation of that process.

5. Other

Wollnik reported that 14th Colony residents on Woodland Hills (Drive/Road) received a letter from Code Enforcement indicating that their subdivision identification sign would be removed prior to sidewalk construction and not replaced. McGrath will follow up on this issue.

6. Adjournment

A motion was made and seconded to adjourn the meeting at 9:20 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Kathy Montanari